
Table of Contents

Preface		xix
Part One		
Scope, Tax Treaty Interpretation and Residence		
Chapter 1: New Zealand: Treaty Interpretation on an Exchange of Information		3
<i>Craig Elliffe</i>		
1.1.	Introduction	3
1.2.	Facts of the case	5
1.3.	The court decision	9
1.3.1.	The evolving law of taxpayer secrecy and no blanket confidentiality obligation	9
1.3.2.	The difference between the Australian DTA (1972) and the Korean DTA (1983)	10
1.3.3.	Making sense of the Korean DTA using the OECD Commentaries	11
1.4.	Comments on the court's reasoning	14
1.4.1.	The role of article 26	14
1.4.2.	The role of the OECD Commentary and the legal basis for its use	15
1.4.3.	Reference to subsequent OECD Model article and Commentaries	16
1.5.	Conclusion	19
Chapter 2: Argentina: Can a PE Deduct General Administration Expenses?		21
<i>Axel A. Verstraeten</i>		
2.1.	Introduction	21
2.2.	Facts of the case	21
2.3.	The court decision	23
2.4.	Comments on the court's reasoning	25
2.4.1.	Status of OECD work for Argentina	25
2.4.2.	Is a devil's proof discriminatory?	26
2.4.3.	Tax treaty policy	27
2.5.	Conclusion	28

Table of Contents

Chapter 3: Spain: Attribution of Free Capital to PEs and Effectiveness of the Authorized OECD Approach	29
<i>Alejandro García Heredia</i>	
3.1. Introduction	29
3.2. Facts of the case	30
3.2.1. General overview	30
3.2.2. Applicable legislation	31
3.2.3. Position of the tax administration	32
3.2.4. Position of the taxpayer	33
3.2.5. The decision by the TEAC	35
3.3. The court decision	37
3.3.1. Banking regulations	37
3.3.2. Domestic tax legislation	38
3.3.3. Interpretation of the Spain-Netherlands tax treaty	38
3.3.4. Most relevant reasoning	39
3.4. Comments on the court's reasoning	39
3.4.1. Connections between banking standards and tax rules: Effects on the allocation of free capital to PEs	40
3.4.2. Effectiveness of the OECD <i>soft law</i> in tax treaty interpretation: Legitimacy of the authorized approach on PEs' profit attribution	43
3.5. Conclusion	48
Chapter 4: South Africa: Is an Exit Levy a Tax?	51
<i>Jennifer Roeleveld and Craig West</i>	
4.1. Introduction	51
4.2. Facts of the case	51
4.3. The courts' decisions	52
4.3.1. The High Court	52
4.3.2. Supreme Court of Appeal	53
4.3.3. Constitutional Court	54
4.4. Comments on the Court's reasoning	56
4.5. Conclusion	59
Chapter 5: Poland: Residence of Individuals	61
<i>Karolina Tetlak</i>	
5.1. Introduction	61
5.2. Facts of the case	63
5.3. The Court decision	64

5.4.	Comments on the Court’s reasoning	65
5.4.1.	Flawed reasoning	65
5.4.2.	What is relevant for the centre of vital interests	66
5.4.3.	How to calculate days of presence	70
5.4.4.	Role of the certificate of residence	72
5.5.	Conclusion	75
Chapter 6:	France: Tax-Exempt Entities Are Not Eligible for Tax Treaty Benefits	79
	<i>Daniel Gutmann</i>	
6.1.	Introduction	79
6.2.	Facts of the case	79
6.3.	The Court decision	80
6.4.	Comments on the Court’s reasoning	80
6.5.	Conclusion	82
Chapter 7:	Portugal: Tax Residence Certification and Entitlement to Compensatory Interest within a Relief at Source System	85
	<i>João Félix Pinto Nogueira</i>	
7.1.	Introduction	85
7.2.	Facts of the case	86
7.2.1.	Introduction	86
7.2.2.	Legal framework	88
7.2.2.1.	Domestic law	88
7.2.2.2.	Tax treaty law	91
7.2.3.	Pleadings of the parties and procedures before this court’s decision	92
7.3.	The court decision	93
7.4.	Comments on the court’s reasoning	94
7.5.	Conclusion	98
Part Two		
Permanent Establishment		
Chapter 8:	Italy: Is there a Permanent Establishment?	105
	<i>Guglielmo Maisto</i>	
8.1.	Introduction	105
8.2.	Legal background and facts of the case	105

Table of Contents

8.2.1.	Legal background	105
8.2.2.	Facts of the case	106
8.3.	The Court’s decision	107
8.4.	Comments on the decision of the Supreme Court	108
Chapter 9:	The Spanish Saga on PEs: The <i>Dell</i> Judgment on “Commissionaires” and “Dependent Subsidiaries”	111
	<i>Adolfo Martín Jiménez</i>	
9.1.	Introduction	111
9.2.	Facts of the case	112
9.3.	The decision of the Central Administrative Tribunal (TEAC)	114
9.4.	The decision of the court (AN)	117
9.5.	Comments on the court’s reasoning	122
9.5.1.	Continuity and heterodoxy in the judgment of the AN in <i>Dell</i>	122
9.5.2.	Actions 7 and 8-10 BEPS and the <i>Dell</i> case	124
9.6.	Conclusion	131
Chapter 10:	India: Sale of Airtime and Agency PE	133
	<i>D.P. Sengupta</i>	
10.1.	Introduction	133
10.2.	Facts of the case	134
10.2.1.	Advertisement revenue – Arguments of the taxpayer	135
10.2.2.	Arguments of the revenue authorities	136
10.2.3.	Revenue from distribution	137
10.3.	The Tribunal decision	137
10.3.1.	Whether advertisement airtime shall fall under the category of goods	137
10.3.2.	Principal and agent relationship	139
10.3.3.	Existence of PE	139
10.3.4.	Existence of PE – Dependent agent PE	140
10.3.5.	Applicability of <i>Morgan Stanley</i> decision	141
10.3.6.	On the issue of royalty	142
10.4.	Comments on the Tribunal’s reasoning	142
10.5.	Conclusion	143

Chapter 11: South Africa: Curious Case of the Service PE	145
<i>Craig West and Jennifer Roeleveld</i>	
11.1. Introduction	145
11.2. Facts of the case	145
11.2.1. Appellant's argument	147
11.2.2. Commissioner's argument	147
11.2.3. For decision by the court	148
11.3. The Tax Court decision	148
11.3.1. Interpretation of articles 5(1) and 5(2)(k) of the DTA	148
11.3.2. The application of articles 5(2)(k) and 5(1) to the facts of the case	149
11.3.3. The appeal against the levying of taxation for the 2008 and 2009 years of assessment	150
11.3.4. The levying of additional tax by the respondent	151
11.3.5. The appeal against the interest	152
11.4. Comments on the Tax Court's reasoning	152
11.5. Conclusion	157
Part Three	
Business Profits and Transfer Pricing	
Chapter 12: Czech Republic: Case 2 Afs 8/2014-174	161
<i>Danuše Nerudová</i>	
12.1. Introduction	161
12.2. Facts of the case	161
12.3. The Court decision	164
12.4. Comments on the Court's reasoning	166
12.5. Conclusion	166
Chapter 13: Italy: Interest-Free Loans and Transfer Pricing	169
<i>Guglielmo Maisto</i>	
13.1. Introduction	169
13.2. Facts of the case	169
13.3. The Court's decision	170
13.4. Comments on the decision of the Court	172
13.5. Conclusion	173

Table of Contents

Chapter 14: Luxembourg: Profit Adjustments for Interest-Free Loans in Accordance with Article 9	175
<i>Werner Haslehner</i>	
14.1. Introduction	175
14.2. Facts of the case	176
14.3. The court decision	177
14.4. Comments on the court's reasoning	178
14.5. Conclusion	182
Chapter 15: Australia: Pricing Money – The <i>Chevron</i> Case	185
<i>Graeme S. Cooper</i>	
15.1. Introduction	185
15.2. Facts of the case	185
15.3. The court decision	188
15.4. Comments on the court's reasoning and conclusion	196
Chapter 16: United States: The <i>Altera</i> Case	199
<i>Yariv Brauner</i>	
16.1. Introduction	199
16.2. Facts of the case	200
16.3. The court decision	201
16.4. Comments on the court's reasoning	206
16.5. Conclusion	209
Chapter 17: Germany: Timing Issues in case of Termination of a Permanent Establishment	211
<i>Alexander Rust</i>	
17.1. Facts of the case	211
17.2. The Court decision	212
17.3. Comments on the Court's reasoning	212
17.4. Conclusion	216

Part Four
Labour Income

Chapter 18: Germany: Taxing Right for a Golden Handshake and the Effect of a Mutual Agreement between the Competent Tax Authorities	219
<i>Alexander Rust</i>	
18.1. Facts of the case	219
18.2. The Court decision	220
18.3. Comments on the Court’s reasoning	222
18.3.1. The applicable distributive rule	222
18.3.2. The impact of the mutual agreement	224
18.4. Conclusion	226
Chapter 19: Austria: Termination Payments	227
<i>Michael Lang, Selina Siller and Stephanie Zolles</i>	
19.1. Introduction	227
19.2. Facts of the case	228
19.3. The Court’s decision	229
19.4. Comments on the Court’s reasoning	231
19.5. Conclusion	234
Chapter 20: Luxembourg: Application of Article 16 to a “Collège des Commissaires”	237
<i>Werner Haslehner</i>	
20.1. Introduction	237
20.2. Facts of the case	238
20.3. The Court decision	239
20.4. Comments on the Court’s reasoning	240
20.5. Conclusion	242
Chapter 21: Austria: Entertainers under Article 17	245
<i>Michael Lang, Selina Siller and Stephanie Zolles</i>	
21.1. Introduction	245
21.2. Facts of the case	246
21.3. The Court’s decision	247
21.4. Comments on the Court’s reasoning	248
21.4.1. The Court’s interpretation of the term “entertainer”	248

Table of Contents

21.4.2.	Relevance of the English and German versions of the Austrian-US Tax Treaty	251
21.4.3.	The OECD Commentary on Article 17	253
21.5.	Conclusion	254
Chapter 22: Belgium: Article 17 OECD Model Still Entertaining Belgian Courts		257
<i>Luc De Broe</i>		
22.1.	Introduction	257
22.2.	Supreme Court 9 January 2015	257
22.2.1.	Facts of the case	257
22.2.2.	The courts' decisions	259
22.2.2.1.	Appreciation by the court of first instance and the Court of Appeal	259
22.2.2.2.	Decision of the Supreme Court	260
22.2.3.	Comments on the Court's reasoning	260
22.2.3.1.	Taxing rights of Belgium under the Belgium-Ireland DTC	260
22.2.3.2.	Opinion of AG Thijs	261
22.2.3.3.	Article 228(2)(8°) Belgian ITC	262
22.2.3.3.1.	Article 228(2)(8°) ITC does not qualify as a "look-through" rule	263
22.2.3.3.2.	Article 228(2)(8°) ITC qualifies as a "look-through" rule	264
22.2.3.3.3.	Ambulatory interpretation of paragraph 8 of the 1992 Commentary on Article 17 OECD Model?	264
22.3.	Supreme Court 21 May 2015	266
22.3.1.	Facts of the case	266
22.3.2.	The courts' decisions	267
22.3.2.1.	Appreciation by the court of first instance and the Court of Appeal	267
22.3.2.2.	Decision of the Supreme Court	268
22.3.3.	Comments on the Court's reasoning	268
22.3.3.1.	Article 17(3) of the 1975 Belgium-Canada DTC	268
22.3.3.2.	Economic interpretation of article 17(1)	269
22.4.	Conclusion	270

Part Five
Beneficial Ownership, Royalties and Capital Gains

Chapter 23: Poland: Beneficial Ownership of Interest in the Context of Cash Pooling	275
<i>Karolina Tetlak</i>	
23.1. Introduction	275
23.2. Facts of the case	276
23.3. The Court decision	278
23.4. Comments on the Court’s reasoning	281
23.5. Conclusion	284
Chapter 24: Bolivia: Treaty Shopping and <i>Pacta Sunt Servanda</i>	287
<i>Alvaro Villegas Aldazosa</i>	
24.1. Introduction	287
24.2. Facts of the case	288
24.3. The Court decision	289
24.4. Comments on the Court’s reasoning	291
24.5. Conclusion	293
Chapter 25: Switzerland: “SWAP Case” and Beneficial Ownership	295
<i>Stefano Bernasconi and Michael Beusch</i>	
25.1. Introduction	295
25.2. Facts of the case	295
25.3. The Court decision	297
25.3.1. Beneficial ownership as an unwritten requirement of article 10(1) DK DTC	298
25.3.2. Components of the concept of beneficial ownership	299
25.4. Comments on the Court’s reasoning	301
25.5. Conclusion	303
Chapter 26: Argentina: Source-Country Approach: Article 7 versus Article 12	305
<i>Axel A. Verstraeten</i>	
26.1. Introduction	305
26.2. Facts the case	305
26.3. The courts’ decisions	306

Table of Contents

26.3.1.	Tax Court	306
26.3.2.	Federal Court of Appeals	307
26.4.	Comments on the court's reasoning	308
26.4.1.	The mechanics of tax treaties	308
26.4.2.	Know-how vs technical assistance	308
26.4.3.	Argentine-source extension	309
26.5.	Conclusion	310
Chapter 27: Australia: Royalties and Business Profits in the IT Sector		313
<i>Graeme S. Cooper</i>		
27.1.	Introduction	313
27.2.	Facts of the case	314
27.3.	The court decision	315
27.4.	Comments on the court's reasoning and conclusion	318
Chapter 28: Netherlands: Exit Taxation of a Substantial Shareholder: Tax Treaty Override?		321
<i>Eric C.C.M. Kemmeren</i>		
28.1.	Introduction	321
28.2.	Facts of the case	322
28.3.	The Court decision	323
28.3.1.	National tax law	323
28.3.2.	Tax treaty law	325
28.4.	Comments on the Court's reasoning	328
28.4.1.	Assumed aim of exit taxes: Taxation of capital appreciation of a substantial interest over period of domestic tax liability	330
28.4.2.	Test of exit tax to articles 26, 27 and 31 VCLT: Good faith	333
28.5.	Residence-based compartmentalization alternative for taxation of capital gains on shares	340
28.5.1.	Appealable order to fix income on which emigration state wants to preserve tax jurisdiction	341
28.5.2.	Compartmentalization of tax jurisdiction	342
28.5.3.	Decrease of value after departure taken into account in emigration state if not included in taxable base in new residence state	342
28.5.4.	Subsequent emigration may trigger taxable event	343
28.5.5.	Mutual assistance in tax collection	343

28.6.	An origin-based alternative for taxation of capital gains on shares	343
28.6.1.	Origin-based alternative in line with OECD's anti-BEPS starting-point	343
28.6.2.	V.1 International tax neutrality	345
28.6.3.	V.2 Origin-based taxation	347
28.6.4.	V.3 Origin-based allocation of tax jurisdiction on business profits, transferred profits and capital gains on shares	348
28.7.	Conclusion	350

Part Six

Relief for Double Taxation and LOB

Chapter 29:	Denmark: Classification of Foreign Income; Double Non-Taxation? Article 26(2) of the Nordic Tax Treaty	355
	<i>Søren Friis Hansen</i>	
29.1.	Introduction	355
29.2.	Facts of the case	355
29.3.	The courts' decisions	356
29.4.	Comments on the courts' reasoning	357
29.5.	Conclusion	358
Chapter 30:	Hungary: Application of Article 23 on Foreign Tax Credit for Lack of Taxable Net Income	359
	<i>Dániel Deák</i>	
30.1.	Introduction	359
30.2.	Facts of the case	359
30.3.	The Court decision	360
30.4.	Comments on the Court's reasoning	361
30.4.1.	Source-country tax on non-income	361
30.4.2.	Treaty law implications	363
30.4.3.	EU law implications	365
30.5.	Conclusion	365

Table of Contents

Chapter 31: United States: The <i>Starr Int'l</i> Case	367
<i>Yariv Brauner</i>	
31.1. Introduction	367
31.2. Facts of the case	367
31.3. The court decision	369
31.3.1. The committed-to-agency-discretion exception	369
31.3.2. Committed to agency discretion	369
31.3.3. Political question doctrine	370
31.3.4. Final holding	371
31.4. Comments on the court's reasoning	371
31.5. Conclusion	372
Chapter 32: Netherlands: Triangular Case and Carve-Out Provision under Dutch-Maltese Tax Treaty	373
<i>Daniël Smit</i>	
32.1. Introduction	373
32.2. The applicable legal framework	373
32.3. The facts of the case	376
32.4. The courts' decisions	377
32.5. Comments on the Court's reasoning	378
32.6. Conclusion	381
Part Seven	
Non-Discrimination, Exchange of Information and Recovery	
Chapter 33: Portugal: Non-Discrimination and Access to Domestic Law Incentives for Individuals in the Residence State	385
<i>João Félix Pinto Nogueira</i>	
33.1. Introduction	385
33.2. Facts of the case	386
33.2.1. Introduction	386
33.2.2. Legal framework	387
33.2.3. Pleadings of the parties and procedures before this court's decision	388
33.3. The court decision	389
33.4. Comments on the court's reasoning	390
33.5. Conclusion	395

Chapter 34: Canada: The Canada-US Enhanced Information Exchange Agreement and the Canada-US Tax Treaty	397
<i>David G. Duff</i>	
34.1. Introduction	397
34.2. Facts of the case	399
34.3. The court decision	401
34.4. Comments on the court's reasoning	403
34.5. Conclusion	407
Chapter 35: Switzerland: Notion of the Persons Involved in the EoI Procedure	409
<i>Michael Beusch</i>	
35.1. Introduction	409
35.2. Facts of the case	410
35.3. The Court decision	411
35.4. Comments on the Court's reasoning	413
35.5. Conclusion	414
Chapter 36: Australia: Enforcing Tax Claims Cross-Border	415
<i>Graeme S. Cooper</i>	
36.1. Introduction	415
36.2. Facts of the case	416
36.3. The court decision	417
36.4. Comments on the Court's reasoning and conclusion	418
List of Cases	419
Contributors	423